

CHAPTER 3

Performance Outcomes Measures

CHAPTER 3

Performance Outcomes Measures

Chapter 3 is an overview of the AoA Performance Outcomes Measures Project. (POMP) The performance measures are based on input from participating State and Area Agencies on Aging, AoA staff, and independent work by Westat and its consultants.

3.1 Purpose of Performance Outcome Measures

There are several general purposes for the performance measures that have been developed for this project. For each purpose, we list the performance measures that may be appropriate for each, although these are only initial placements and may be revised upon review. The general purposes are:

Targeting. One important purpose of collecting performance measures in the aging network is to determine whether or not services are targeted to persons with the greatest social and economic need, as the Older Americans Act (OAA) requires. This is accomplished by comparing results to a pre-established standard or other external criterion, such as Medicaid eligibility criteria (e.g. frailty, poverty etc.), the results from prior research, or the results from population-based surveys. Likely performance measures in this project that could be used for this purpose are the measures for Physical Functioning and Nutritional Risk, although other measures could be used as well.

Explore Service, Program or Community Differences. Most community-based long-term care services, such as those funded by the Administration on Aging, were designed to have an impact on clients' physical health, functional capacity, and other domains of functioning in both direct and indirect ways. Benefits in these and other areas may or may not occur for particular clients, but these effects are difficult to trace to Older Americans Act (OAA) program participation. However, performance measures serve a useful and important purpose by helping to identify, explore, or monitor important aspects of the services provided or the communities and client populations served by programs, even where no clear link to services can be established. Some of the likely performance measures to be used for this purpose are: Physical Functioning; Nutritional Risk ; Emotional Well-Being; Caregiver Satisfaction; Home Care Satisfaction (HCSM); Social Functioning; Capacity Building; Transportation Satisfaction, Information and Assistance Satisfaction and any item from the BRFSS or other population-based surveys.

To Estimate Service Effects. One of the traditional uses of performance measurement is to analyze the accomplishments of a program or service for service recipients. Among the list of proposed performance measures, three appear to directly measure the effects of services provided. The Caregiver Satisfaction, Case Management, and Home Care Satisfaction measures are the only *outcome measures* in the technical sense of the word. Other performance measures may be appropriate for this purpose but only if targeted at specific groups of clients and specific services. For example, for clients recovering from specific

short-term medical problems such as fractures, performances measures for Physical Functioning could represent outcomes of some services funded by the Administration on Aging. However, because this type of targeted evaluation is only applicable to a minority of clients, the use of these performance measures for this purpose is not recommended for this project.

As a Control Variable: One final purpose for collecting some performance measures is that, independently of their utility as performance measures in their own right, they often play a critical role in helping to understand the results from other performance measures. For example, physical functioning has been shown to influence responses on other performance measures, such as client satisfaction. The differences in physical functioning must be controlled for when analyzing other performance measures across groups of clients (or programs). This ensures that the groups are statistically equivalent in ways known to influence responses on other performance measures.

Table 2 summarizes the performance measures that fall under each purpose.

Table 2. Purposes for Performance Measures

Performance Measures	Selected Purposes			
	Targeting	Exploring Service, Program or Community Differences	Estimating Effects of Services	Control Variable
Physical Functioning	X	X	X (only if targeted)	X
Nutritional Risk	X	X	X (only if targeted)	
Caregiver		X		
Emotional Well-Being		X		
Home Care	X	X	X	
Transportation		X	X	
Information & Assistance	X		X	
Social Functioning		X		
Capacity Building		X		

3.2 Constructing Performance Measures

Along with different purposes for collecting data for performance measures, there are a variety of options for constructing each performance measure. Typically, each performance measure is operationalized (that is, precisely defined in measurable terms) as one or more numerical indicators. These indicators may be simple numerical facts about an agency (e.g., number of clients served in a given time period; number of services provided in a given time period; single or multiple-item responses scores from questionnaires or standardized assessment instruments; or proportions or percentages created by two or more separate indicators). At best, the indicators must be based on standard psychometric criteria of

validity and reliability, feasible to collect, understandable to administrators and users, related to the purposes or goals of an agency or program. Performance measures are often based on administrative data already collected but also may involve original data collection, using measures specifically designed for that purpose. A variety of statistical methods are used to analyze these indicators, but the core conceptual framework is to compare an agency's performance (however measured) to one or more standards, often called benchmarks. Three types of benchmarks can be used:

Compare results to pre-established standard or external criterion. One way to use a performance measure is to compare the results to a pre-established standard or an external criterion, such as Medicaid eligibility criteria, results predicted from previous research or from the results from a population-based survey. This use of performance measurement is most common, but also the most limited, because this type of use makes it difficult to compare the results between agencies or programs. This use of performance measurement does not require that all sites use the same indicator for a given performance measure.

Examine changes over time. A more sophisticated use of performance measurement is to analyze trends in performance measures over time. Typically, change scores in the performance measure (improvement, no change, or declines) are used. This type of use allows a single agency or program to compare its results to past performance. Because the most typical comparison is within a single agency or program, this type of performance measurement does not require that all sites use the same indicator.

Compare results across multiple users. This use of performance measures is the most powerful, but requires the most cooperation among the network. Agencies or programs using a common indicator for a performance measure compare their results to one or two benchmarks: (1) comparing the results to the average results for all sites using the same measure; and (2) comparing the results to expected results for similar groups of clients. This latter comparison requires the inclusion of client demographic and other variables as controls to ensure that the groups are statistically equivalent.

3.3 Summary of the Performance Measures

The following tables describe the draft performance measures for this project. The columns in the performance measurement tables are as follows:

Performance Measure: This column provides the proposed questions or the conceptual areas and the method for scoring the questions.

Purpose: In this column, we list the purpose of each performance measure.

Recommended Services: For each purpose, the specific services that are appropriate for the intended purpose(s) is provided.

Available Population-Based Survey Questions: For each performance measure, the available population-based survey questions are listed. These are typically from the BRFSS, the National Long-Term Care Survey, or other studies.

Comments/Application Issues: More detailed comments about the performance measures are included in this column.

PERFORMANCE MEASURE: PHYSICAL FUNCTIONING

Performance Measure	Purposes	Recommended Services	Available Population-based Survey Questions	Comments/Applications Issues
<p>Activities of Daily Living (Katz, Ford, Moskowitz, Jackson, & Jaffe, 1963):</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> --Bathing --Dressing or Undressing --Eating --Using the Toilet --Get in or out of Bed or Chair --Get around the House* <p>* not on original Katz ADL assessment</p> <p>Instrumental Activities of Daily Living (Lawton & Brody, <i>Gerontologist</i>, 9:179-186, 1969)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> --Handling Personal Finances --Meal Preparation --Shopping --Traveling About the Community --Doing Housework --Using Telephone --Taking Medication 	<p><u>Targeting:</u></p> <p>Compare ADL dependency score to a pre-established standard or external criterion such as, Medicaid eligibility criteria, national norms established from population-based surveys; e.g., number and % of participants with ADL dependencies compared to the general elderly population.</p>	<p>When used for targeting, the focus is the client's capacity to perform ADLs and IADLs and would be applicable to services received by clients for which this information is available.</p>	<p>ADL and IADL measures from the Behavior Risk Factor Surveillance System (BRFSS):</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> -- For how long have your activities been limited because of your major impairment or health? -- Because of any impairment or health problem, do you need the help of other persons with your PERSONAL CARE needs, such as eating, bathing, dressing, or getting around the house? --Because of any impairment or health problem, do you need the help of other persons in handling your ROUTINE needs, such as everyday household chores, doing necessary business, shopping, or getting around for other purposes? <p>National long-term Care Survey (ADL/IADL data)</p> <p>SIPP Disability Topical Module</p> <p>National Health Interview Survey on Disability, Supplement on Aging II</p>	<p>Although numerous physical functioning assessment instruments have been developed since the Katz measure was developed over 30 years ago, it is the most thoroughly tested and widely used.</p> <p>Some type of ADL assessment is routinely collected in most states and agencies for case managed services, usually on an annual basis. However, this information is not standardized and always computerized. Even when computerized, the information is not updated consistently, so that it is hard to determine when the functional assessment occurred and the time period involved.</p> <p>Other appropriate comparisons can be made, including for example eligibility criteria for home and community based long term care services to show where OAA clients fall along a continuum of need and care.</p> <p>Physical functioning may also be used as a control variable.</p>

PERFORMANCE MEASURE: NUTRITIONAL RISK

Performance Measure	Purposes	Recommended Services	Available Population-based Survey Questions	Comments/Applications Issues
<p>Several questions were added to the NSI, including food security, dietary recall, and other areas over which the SUA/AAA program has an opportunity for positive influence. Please see Nutritional Risk questionnaire in the notebook.</p>	<p><u>Targeting:</u></p> <p>Compare NR scores to a pre-established standard; for example, number and % of clients who are nutritionally at risk compared to nutrition items on BRFS.</p> <p><u>Exploring Service, Program or Community Differences:</u></p> <p>Examine changes in NR scores over time; for example, number and % of clients determined to be nutritionally at risk whose NSI scores improve, stay the same, or decline over time.</p>	<p>Home delivered meals</p> <p>Congregate meals</p> <p>Nutrition education</p>	<p>Nutrition items on fruits and vegetables on the Behavioral Risk Factors Surveillance System (BRFSS):</p> <p>-- How often do you drink fruit juices such as orange, grapefruit, or tomato?</p> <p>-- Not counting juice, how often do you eat fruit?</p> <p>-- How often do you eat green salad?</p> <p>-- How often do you eat potatoes not including French fries, fried potatoes, or potato chips?</p> <p>-- How often do you eat carrots?</p> <p>-- Not counting carrots, potatoes, or salad, how many servings of vegetables do you usually eat?</p> <p>For each question the client is asked to provide information on the number of times specific food(s) are eaten per day, per week, per month. Other options include, never, don't know/not sure/refused.</p> <p>CPS Food security survey.</p>	<p>Sustaining or improving the nutritional status of older adults is an important goal of AoA-funded nutrition services.</p> <p>The NR is a measure of nutritional risk, and therefore the performance measure is targeted at those clients. This requires first assessing the nutritional risk of clients using the NSI, then targeting the evaluation to those found to be at risk.</p> <p>AoA currently requires administration of the NSI for all congregate meals and home delivered meal recipients and reporting of summary scores for clients who score 6 or more on the NSI.</p>

PERFORMANCE MEASURE: EMOTIONAL WELL-BEING

Performance Measure	Purposes	Recommended Services	Available Population-based Survey Questions	Comments/Applications Issues
<p>Emotional well-being questions build on the results of recent research on depression, anxiety, fatigue, and other quality of life measures.</p>	<p>Examine changes in responses to items over time (e.g. number and % of clients whose responses indicate improvement, no change, or decline in emotional well-being).</p>	<p>All services (Use a sample survey to track changes).</p>	<p>Three questions on mood and affect from the BRFSS:</p> <p>-- During the past 30 days, for about how many days have you felt sad, blue, or depressed?</p> <p>-- During the past 30 days, for about how many days have you felt worried, tense, or anxious.</p> <p>--During the past 30 days, for about how many days have you felt you did not get enough rest or sleep?</p> <p>For each question, the respondent is asked to provide the number of days. Other options for each question are: "None; don't know/Not sure; and Refused."</p>	<p>John Ware's recent research strongly suggests that emotional well-being is an important domain of functioning, as well as an area over which OAA services have considerable influence.</p> <p>Title III-B services do not directly target mental health issues. However, depression, anxiety or worry can affect physical health as well as receipt of long-term care services and social functioning. A recent evaluation of a HUD community-based long-term care program conducted by Westat showed that the greatest impact of case management, personal care and other in-home services occurred in the quality of life outcomes arena.</p>

PERFORMANCE MEASURE: CAREGIVER SATISFACTION

Performance Measure	Purposes	Recommended Services	Available Population-based Survey Questions	Comments/Applications Issues
<p>Questions on caregiver support and satisfaction, developed for this project, come from prior research, including the impact of caregiving on work, the home environment, and the efficacy of formal services on lowering burden and enhancing caregiver quality of life.</p>	<p><u>Exploring Service, Program, or Community Differences</u></p> <p>Examine changes over time; for example, number and % of caregivers whose stress scores improve, stay the same, or decline over time</p> <p>Compare individual agency/program scores on these items to benchmark; for example, to average score or change score for all agencies/programs; or to expected score or change score for similar groups of clients (case-mix adjustments using client demographics are needed for this analysis.)</p> <p>Develop composite score across measures.</p>	<p>Respite Care Adult Day Care Home Care (e.g., IADL support) Personal Care (ADL support)</p>	<p>AARP Survey on Family Caregivers</p> <p>National Long Term Care Survey - Caregiver Supplement</p> <p>US Census - Survey of Caregivers</p>	<p>The provision of support to family members is both a direct objective as well as an indirect benefit of AoA-funded services (e.g., provision of home care may lessen family caregiver burden.)</p> <p>Another measure of the effectiveness of family caregiving support is the extent to which the receipt of services does not displace family caregiving and contact with relatives but enhances the quality of the interaction among family members.</p> <p>This performance measure will require a separate assessment process with caregivers. The assessment that is recommended can be done by phone, in face-to-face interviews, or by mail questionnaire.</p>

PERFORMANCE MEASURE: HOME CARE SATISFACTION MEASURE (HCSM)

Performance Measure	Purposes	Recommended Services	Available Population-based Survey Questions	Comments/ Applications Issues
<p>The Home Care Satisfaction Measure (HCSM) (Geron, 1997) will be used for this project.</p> <p>This instrument illustrates the basic tenets of good consumer satisfaction measurement:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • focus on program aspects over which agency has some reasonable control; • measure individual components of a program rather than asking general, global yes/no questions • provide a range of satisfaction ratings from low to high, avoiding global, yes/no questions. 	<p><u>Estimating Effects of Services</u></p> <p>Examine changes over time; for example, number and % of clients whose average satisfaction scores for individual services improve, stay the same, or decline over time.</p> <p>Compare individual agency/program satisfaction scores for specific services to benchmark; for example, to average satisfaction score or change score for all agencies/programs providing similar services; or compare to expected satisfaction score or change score for similar groups of clients receiving same services (case-mix adjustments using client demographics are needed for this analysis)</p>	<p>Homemaker; Personal Care; Home Delivered Meals; Case Management.</p>	<p>None available, but many OAA programs now use the HCSM, providing some basis for comparison.</p>	<p>The HCSM requires face to face or telephone interviews with clients. These assessments can not be completed by the client's case manager, or any one else associated with the decision to authorize services for the client.</p> <p>No standardized satisfaction measures are currently available for transportation, adult day care, information and referral services, or the other Title III-B funded services not addressed by the HCSM.</p> <p>The HCSM has been established as a reliable and valid measure of client satisfaction. It currently is used by several states, Area Agencies, and other agencies.</p> <p>Different measures of customer satisfaction that are used by agencies will be reviewed for this project.</p>

PERFORMANCE MEASURE: SOCIAL FUNCTIONING

Performance Measure	Purpose	Recommended Services	Available Population-based Survey Questions	Comments/ Applications Issues
<p>Social Functioning questions developed for this project identify the frequency and type of interaction between client, family, and friends.</p>	<p>Exploring Service, Program or Community Differences</p> <p>Compare to a pre-established standard or external criterion; for example, average number of times spoken to someone compared to program goals or item on the OARS instrument.</p> <p>Examine changes over time; for example, average number of times spoken to someone increased, stayed the same, or declined over time.</p> <p>Compare individual agency/program scores for these items to benchmark; for example, to average social functioning score or change scores for agencies/programs providing similar services; or to expected social functioning score or change score for similar groups of clients receiving same services (case-mix adjustments using client demographics are needed for this analysis)</p>	<p>Transportation; Congregate Meals; Home Delivered Meals; Personal Care.</p>	<p>Item from SF 36: During the past 4 weeks, to what extent has your physical health or emotional problems interfered with your normal social activities with family, friends, neighbors, or groups?</p> <p>Response options include: not at all; slightly; moderately; quite a bit; extremely</p>	<p>Measures of social functioning can indicate the extent to which an agency/program is fostering social well being among clients.</p> <p>Several grantees collect measures of well being. There is interest among agencies that do not currently collect measures of social functioning to begin collecting such information.</p> <p>AoA is working with CDC in developing a similar question for the BRFSS.</p>

PERFORMANCE MEASURE: CAPACITY BUILDING (in development)

Performance Measure	Purposes and specific Examples	Recommended Services	Available Population-based Survey Questions	Comments/ Applications Issues
<p>Capacity building is mandated by the Older Americans Act, and is an important function of the network. A questionnaire on capacity building for agency administrators will focus on the following areas:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • collaboration among partnership agencies to accomplish a goal (e.g., sponsoring legislation) or providing a service) • leveraging of funds for the provision of services • research activities (e.g., needs assessments, program evaluation, performance measurement, etc.) 		<p>Not applicable. These items relate to program development and the systems advocacy work of the network. However, some of the most important capacity- building initiatives cover establishment of Medicaid waiver home care programs</p>	<p>Percentage of Medicaid expenditures going for nursing home care versus home-care programs</p>	<p>Collection of this information is important to demonstrate the efforts of the aging network to achieve AoA objectives. The information can be culled from existing administrative data.</p> <p>Qualitative methods, including use of interviews and review of archival information, should be used to provide a context for understanding program accomplishments.</p> <p>Not all sites will have sufficient management information systems to collect these data items. Individual surveys may need to be conducted in some case.</p>

PERFORMANCE MEASURE: TRANSPORTATION SATISFACTION

Performance Measure	Purposes and specific Examples	Recommended Services	Available Population-based Survey Questions	Comments/ Applications Issues
<p>Client satisfaction with services providing transportation for elders, based on the following factors:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - acceptability - accessibility - adaptability - availability - affordability - alternatives, and - assessment. 	<p>Purposes are to assess transportation services in ways that are meaningful for management -- in other words, to create service improvements. For example, under acceptability, individual factors include equipment, reliability of arrival and departure times, trust and confidence, image and attractiveness, and service quality. For availability, the factors include days of the week and hours of the day service is available, convenience, and whether or not enough service is provided.</p>	<p>The basic service concepts could easily be applied to other services as well.</p>	<p>Not available in general. Information specific to particular communities and transportation services may be available. Some states have extensive specialized transportation service data files.</p> <p>Basic transit service information is available from the National Transit Database of the Federal Transit Administration (FTA) and American Public Transit Association (APTA) files for the mass transit industry; the community Transportation Association (CTAA) maintains data files for FTA on rural and specialized transportation services from FTA's 5310 and 5311 funds.</p>	<p>Collection of this information is important to validate the efficacy of transportation services.</p> <p>Quantitative methods, including correlations with demographic data and social functioning, can be used to provide higher-quality transportation services.</p> <p>Many sites will not have sufficient management information systems to collect basic transportation data. Individual surveys will need to be conducted to collect satisfaction information.</p>

PERFORMANCE MEASURE: INFORMATION AND ASSISTANCE SATISFACTION

Performance Measure	Purposes and specific Examples	Recommended Services	Available Population-based Survey Questions	Comments/ Applications Issues
<p>Client satisfaction with services providing information and assistance for elders, based on the following factors:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Ease of access - Level of information and assistance provided - Actual receipt of services - Expectations regarding resolution of issues for which information or assistance was needed - Overall assessment as a service that could be recommended to others. 	<p>Purposes are to assess information and assistance services in ways that are meaningful for management -- in other words, to create service improvements.</p> <p>For example, under level of information and assistance provided, individual factors include the degree to which the caller felt that the staff member showed care and respect to the caller, trust and confidence in the persons providing the assistance, and service quality. For overall assessment, the measure is whether or not the individual would recommend the service to others.</p>	<p>Information and assistance or information and referral services. (The basic service concepts could be applied to other services as well, but the focus is on the transfer of information.)</p>	<p>Not available.</p>	<p>Collection of this information is important to validate the efficacy of information and assistance services.</p> <p>Quantitative methods, including correlations with staffing patterns, service, hours, demographic data, and social functioning, can be used to design and provide higher-quality services.</p> <p>It is not expected that many sites will have management information systems already in place to collect satisfaction data for information and assistance services. Individual surveys will need to be conducted to collect satisfaction information.</p>